

Group guidance with photovoice technique to increase empathy of student

Denok Setiawati ^{a,1*}, Sarah Kurnia Miranda ^{a,2}, Muhamad Afifuddin Ghozali ^{b,3}

^a Department of Guidance and Counseling, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia

^b Department of Master in Counseling, Universiti Brunei Darussalam, Bandar Seri Begawan, Brunei Darussalam

¹ denoksetiawati@unesa.ac.id*; ² sarahkurnia15@gmail.com, ³ 20M4024@ubd.edu.bn

* corresponding author

ARTICLE INFO

Article history

Received: December 7, 2023

Revised: December 21, 2023

Accepted: December 29, 2023

Keywords

Group Guidance

Empathy

Photovoice technique

Students

ABSTRACT

This research aims to measure the increase in student empathy after implementing group guidance using the photovoice technique. The type of research is quasi-experimental without a control group used in this research. The research subjects were 10 students with high, medium, and low empathy scores randomly determined as the research sample. The implementation procedure was carried out in six sessions using a plan designed collaboratively between group guidance and photovoice techniques. This research shows differences in scores before and after receiving treatment. The Wilcoxon test was carried out to analyze the data with an assumption sig (2-tailed) result of 0.005, which showed that the alternative hypothesis that applying photovoice technique group guidance could increase Surabaya students' empathy was accepted. The conclusion that can be drawn from this research is that group guidance using the photovoice technique can improve empathy skills.

This is an open-access article under the [CC-BY-SA](#) license.



1. Introduction

Humans, as social creatures, should always need help from others; in this life, mutual assistance occurs through interaction between individuals and each other. Good interaction between individuals requires good communication. Good communication happens when individuals know or are sensitive to what other people feel and can foster a sense of empathy (Zulvianti, 2012). Someone who can feel and understand other people's situations can be called an empath. Empathy is an essential substance in personal life; in an overseas study, it was shown that the urgency to prepare students to face the educational demands of the 21st century is very high (Walther et al., 2020). Empathy is an essential psychological construct in building relationships with other people (Primasari et al., 2021). According to Claus, empathy is a multifaceted construct that significantly impacts social behavior (Lamm et al., 2019). According to the opinion of (Davis et al., 2004), an individual's ability to see other people's perspectives is called empathy.

Empathy is when we show that we care about others. Social empathy is also needed to build strong relationships and create peace. With attention like this, everyone can instill a sense of affection for each other (Siombiwi et al., 2022). This comfort is still challenging to feel, as shown in the daily life that students often experience with low empathy. Self-comfort usually comes from peaceful thoughts with a sense of caring, courage, and love (Supriyanto et al., 2024). This can be seen when students interact inside and outside the classroom. Students tend not to listen when their friends in front of the class are making presentations, students also don't listen to the teacher's explanation when explaining the material, students are indifferent when their friends need help, and

some students call other students' parents names as a source of ridicule. This is a problem experienced by students after COVID-19 (Supriyanto et al., 2022).

The observations showed that several students' attitudes showed a lack of empathy for their friends. Lack of feelings of respect for their friends who are given the task of making presentations, the majority of students talk to the friend next to them. Some students even openly don't want to listen to the teacher's explanation when explaining the material. The following case is that indifferent students who don't want to help and tend to be selfish don't help their friends when they face difficulties, and they argue that it is none of their business. Some students made fun of their friends' parents' names. This makes the teaching and learning atmosphere in the classroom less comfortable. Professional teachers create a conducive learning climate with a peaceful learning climate and experienced teachers with peaceful minds impact students' calmness in learning (Saputra et al., 2020).

Some of the problems caused by low empathy have created disturbing chaos. The lack of ability to empathize is mainly caused by individuals who don't understand the meaning of empathy, and a lack of information and efforts to increase empathy are also thought to be the causes (Primasari, 2021). Based on the needs assessment, it was found that personal problems were in first place with 40.40%, and social issues were in second place with a percentage of 22.87%. Students feel embarrassed when hanging out with friends; students tend to get angry quickly without knowing the cause, and students also tend to feel like people who are indifferent to other people. If problems aren't immediately addressed, it is feared that students will become individuals who are indifferent to the circumstances around them. Building student empathy at school closely relates to routine educational components and processes. Education forms empathy skills and abilities as the key to self-needs for the future (Nechita, 2018).

This systematic way helps students improve their ability to make decisions and guide their own lives. Ultimately, they gain wisdom from experience and can contribute to society. The alternative offered to be implemented by the school is to utilize group guidance because empathy requires dynamic interaction involving oneself and others. Services that assist students in getting to know their personality better, developing social skills and making decisions are carried out by utilizing group dynamics, namely group guidance (Siombiwi et al., 2022). Group guidance requires several students in groups to carry out activities together. From these activities, students can gain knowledge and information from the guidance and counselling teacher and jointly discuss topics that benefit students' understanding of their lives and are helpful for their personal development and decision-making considerations (Siombiwi et al., 2022). School counsellors as professional guidance and counselling teachers can conduct professional services with quality guidance service practices (Setianingrum & Da Costa, 2023).

Empathy skills can also be developed through group guidance using photovoice techniques. Wang said that this photovoice technique has been widely used by researchers in research that is closely related to increasing understanding and attention to life problems. Ratna explained that the photovoice technique uses photos or images participants have taken as research media (Mysyuk & Huisman, 2020). Taking pictures is a creative method; a photo can be worth over a thousand words. One of the advantages of the photovoice technique is that it is easy to learn and can be used by almost everyone. This technique allows someone to document their activities; conversely, they gain insight by taking photos and carrying out group discussions. From the discussion process, someone will gain a new understanding and perspective, and it is hoped that this can change that person's situation (Ulviatun, 2016).

Photovoice has had broad appeal since its inception as an effective way for researchers in communities in various parts of the world to study different human knowledge; this will help change a person's personal and social environment (Pralibroda, 2009). Therefore, this photovoice technique also applies to providing individual and social services. Students can be invited to see reality by using a camera lens and taking pictures from various sides of life. This makes them—interested in giving them a voice so that other people can see what they see and the photo's perspective (Farida, 2015). Psychological effects were found when the activity of interpreting images was carried out in-depth (Creighton et al., 2018). Information processing media that is seen visually will produce a perspective.

The resulting perspective will be combined with emotional effects, namely the emergence of emotional upheaval, which can influence the ability to empathize (Primasari et al., 2021). The power of increasing empathy in photovoice technique group guidance is more about students learning to listen to the explanations of friends telling them about the photos they have taken. It works when students show pictures with text explaining how they feel about others; other people see the image, and others respond to it. From there, other people will be able to understand other people's feelings and situations. Students also learn to express their feelings by telling stories about the photos they have taken. Then, a discussion was held regarding increasing empathy in the school environment and the community so that students could apply empathy anywhere. This background underlies the importance of implementing the photovoice technique group guidance service to increase students' empathy.

2. Method

2.1. Research design

The research adopts a quantitative approach, where data is presented numerically to describe the research findings accurately. The study employs an experimental design, specifically a One Group Pretest-Posttest model, which aims to evaluate the impact of a particular treatment on a single group. This design allows for the observation of changes in the dependent variable, providing insights into the effects of the experimental intervention (Ali & Asrori, 2014).

2.2. Participants

The participants in this study are drawn from the population of class VII A students at SMP Negeri 17 Surabaya, consisting of 29 students. A simple random sampling technique was utilized to ensure that each student in the population had an equal chance of being selected for the sample (Hamdi and Bahrudin, 2014). Ten students were randomly chosen from this population to participate, forming the research sample for data collection and analysis.

2.3. Data collection tools

The primary tool for data collection in this study is the empathy scale, designed to measure students' levels of empathy. This scale includes a series of statement items in essay format, where participants respond based on their perceptions. The responses are categorized into four levels: 4 = Very suitable, 3 = Appropriate, 2 = Not Appropriate, and 1 = Not Appropriate, allowing for a nuanced measurement of empathy.

2.4. Research procedure

The research procedure began with administering the empathy scale to all selected participants before any treatment was applied, serving as the pretest. Following this, the experimental treatment was introduced, after which the same empathy scale was administered again as a posttest. This pretest-posttest method enabled the researchers to compare the initial and final empathy scores, providing data on the impact of the treatment on the students' empathy levels.

2.5. Data analysis

Data analysis was carried out using the Wilcoxon signed-rank test, a non-parametric method chosen due to the ordinal nature of the empathy data. This statistical test is suitable for analyzing paired data, as it compares the pretest and posttest scores from the same group of participants to determine any significant differences (Fitri & Haryanti, 2020). The analysis helps interpret the experimental treatment's effect on the participants' empathy, contributing to the overall findings of the research.

3. Results and Discussion

The initial data presented was obtained through administering an empathy questionnaire, the validity of which was tested in class to understand the initial condition of the students selected as research subjects. The pre-test results were grouped into three groups: low, medium and high. Based on pre-test scores, which had been grouped, it was found that ten students who would be subjects had been selected randomly. Table 1 describes the students who will be used as samples.

Table 1. Pre-test results data for research subjects

Number	Identity	Score	Categories
1	PBA	84	Average
2	MFA	74	Average
3	GSA	69	Average
4	JJS	45	Low
5	MFFP	43	Low
6	REAP	42	Low
7	RBAP	40	Low
8	AFA	40	Low
9	MBSP	39	Low
10	JBCP	37	Low

The research involved subjects who completed a student empathy pretest questionnaire and were randomly selected for the study. The treatment was administered over six meetings. Details of the treatment for these subjects are outlined below. At the first meeting, the facilitator establishes a rapport with the research subjects, and the subjects are explained why they were gathered. Research subjects learned about empathy and watched videos of examples of empathetic behaviour in everyday life. Subjects were asked to express their opinions after seeing the video. Subjects begin to understand empathy and its benefits when living everyday life. This was seen during the activity; students were enthusiastic about asking questions and wanted to learn more about photovoice techniques.

This second session explained the subjects' methods and ethics of taking good photos. The subjects observed the explanation given with enthusiasm. During the question-and-answer session, the subjects also took turns asking questions about which photos were allowed or not allowed, as well as the theme and place where the images were taken. After that, the subjects were tasked with taking pictures with empathy for friends or family. These photos will be collected at the next meeting at the agreed time. The author is also open to any questions you want to ask via the WhatsApp group with the subjects.

In this third session of the meeting, the activity carried out was collecting photos. After the photos of the subjects have been collected, the author then discusses with each subject the reasons for selecting the photos. If the subject is still unsure about the photos taken, the subject is still allowed to change the photo and will be discussed again with the author. Some of the questions the author asked the subject included "What is happening in the photo?", "who is in the photo?" "Why did you take the photo with him? Does he have meaning in your life?". "how do you empathize with friends or family according to the photo that has been taken?" After that, the subject will explain about the photo and whether the photo can be used to describe empathy with friends or family. Subjects can ask questions or give opinions about whether the photo is based on empathy.

At the fourth session of the meeting, presentations were made by each subject. Each subject presented photos they had taken and discussed previously. The presentation session was held in an orderly manner. After one subject presents his picture, the other subjects can take turns asking questions or giving their opinions about the photo. In this activity, the subjects were taught to listen to their friends explaining in front of them and to respect their friends who might be slightly shy or nervous. The subjects learned not to judge their friends who presented stiffly or less fluently and to support their friends by listening to their presentations. In this presentation session, two subjects told their stories to the subjects next to them. Then, the other subjects reprimanded them using polite language so that the subjects could better respect their friend who was making the presentation. After that, the presentation went smoothly until the fourth session ended. Subjects who don't have their turn to present due to limited time will continue at the next meeting.

At the fifth meeting session, subjects unable to present their photos will be allowed to present them with other subjects. The presentation at this meeting was a little disturbed because group guidance activities were carried out in the hall, which would be used for sports exams, so in the middle of the session, we had to move to the mosque foyer. However, this didn't reduce the subjects' enthusiasm to continue presenting the photos they had taken. Each subject presented their photo, then continued with discussion and question and answer activities. After all the subjects had presented their pictures, the author and the subjects reflected on empathy and asked them about the

meaning of empathy for them. Next, the activity continued with preparations for the next meeting. At the sixth session of the conference, subjects were asked to upload photos that had been taken and presented. After the treatment, ten research subjects were directed to fill out the same empathy questionnaire. The aim is to see changes in the subject after being given treatment.

After the treatment, ten research subjects were directed to fill out the same empathy questionnaire. The aim is to see changes in the subject after being given treatment. The data of the post-test is described in Table 2.

Table 2. The data of post-test

Number	Identity	Score	Categories
1	PBA	93	High
2	MFA	84	Average
3	GSA	82	Average
4	JJS	61	Average
5	MFFP	79	Average
6	REAP	76	Average
7	RBAP	80	Average
8	AFA	85	Average
9	MBSP	70	Average
10	JBCP	60	Average

The pre-test and post-test scores were analyzed using the Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test. This analysis aims to identify differences in students' empathy levels before and after the treatment. The results will indicate whether there is an increase in student empathy following the treatment. The Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test was chosen because it is suitable for testing paired data that don't follow a normal distribution. Therefore, the analysis results will provide a more accurate picture of the treatment's effectiveness in enhancing student empathy. Table 5 shows the data analysis with the Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test.

Table 3. Analysis with Wilcoxon signed ranks test

Information	Coefficient
N	10
Negative Ranks	0
Positive Ranks	10
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	.005

Interpretation of Table 3 shows that a positive rank of 10 becomes N (indicating the difference log), and a negative rank of 0 becomes x (lower number of symbols). With $N = 10$ and $X = 0$ (z), we get (probability of a value below H_0) = 0.005. If the level of certainty (error rate) of 5% is 0.05, then $0.005 < 0.05$ results in the conclusion that H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted. As can be seen from the table above, there are differences in students' pretest and posttest empathy scores.

Group guidance using photovoice techniques is an alternative service that can help improve empathy skills in middle school students. The combination of presenting photos and discussing the meaning of the photos can significantly increase empathy skills. Each group member can share information regarding perceptions about a photo and the meaning of the photo. The meaning of one or more photos in counselling, especially in guidance groups, as an institution for searching for meaning that is a builder of narratives, a guardian of bonds, a regulator of emotions, and a process of reviewing contextual experiences (Jiménez-Alonso & Bresco de Luna, 2022). Counsellors can target meaning-making through photos (Delgado & Wester, 2020), especially with the help of Artificial Intelligence.

During the photovoice technique group guidance treatment process, group members will be directed to interpret an image, which interactive discussions in group guidance activities will reinforce. The photovoice technique is where photos become the primary medium to evoke someone's emotional feelings. Photos occupy the primary position in the photovoice technique, so the selection of photos must contain an emotional element. Photos must have deep meaning and can

arouse emotional turmoil in those who view them (Primasari et al., 2021). Implementing group guidance on photovoice techniques to increase empathy can train individuals to process information cognitively while playing an influential role. This is the opinion of (Davis, 2004), who emphasizes that empathy consists of several dimensions. First is the cognitive ability to take other people's perspectives. Second, the tendency to pay attention to other people can give rise to emotional empathy. When group guidance begins, the author acts as a group leader who must actively encourage group members to be involved in implementation.

The research was conducted on ten students with low, medium and high empathy scores. Ten students with low, medium and high empathy scores were given group guidance treatment using photovoice techniques to increase their empathy abilities from low to medium and high scores, and those with high empathy were able to maintain their empathy abilities. The treatment results can be seen in increased students' empathy scores. Empathy is one of the standards of student success through the role of teachers who teach empathy (Meyers et al., 2019). Social-emotional competencies formed early on give rise to emotional support in individuals (Aldrup, Carstensen, & Klusmann, 2022). Increased student empathy can at least manage problems that arise later on (Wink, LaRusso, & Smith, 2021).

The author tries to support internal and external validity by using the photovoice technique group guidance service and a quasi-experimental research design with one group pretest-posttest design without a control group. The pretest and posttest results can be seen using the Wilcoxon test. From the Wilcoxon test results, the z value was obtained (-2.803) with sig. 2 tailed .005. H_a is accepted, and H_o is rejected, so group guidance using photovoice techniques is practical in increasing empathy for junior high school students. Success factors in increasing middle school students' empathy are influenced by (1) students' understanding of how to train and improve empathy skills through photovoice techniques, (2) their understanding of the importance of increasing the ability to empathize with oneself, (3) The emergence of awareness to get used to empathizing with the surrounding environment through interpreting photos. This is caused by the involvement of cognitive processes through visual capture combined with the sensation of emotional turmoil so that several of the factors above can emerge and cause an increase in empathy scores. This statement is supported by several research results, which state that photovoice can also reduce negative stigma due to increased individual attention (Tippin & Maranzan 2019). Other research results supporting this statement are photovoice, which has increased personal awareness of maintaining health, thereby increasing individual productivity in daily life (Massengale et al. 2016).

This research shows that photovoice in group guidance can increase the ability of teenagers with mental disorders to voice their perspectives and experiences through empathy. Several presentations of these findings support research findings that photovoice can be used to improve structures involved in emotional activities, including empathy. In this study, a significant increase in empathy scores was obtained due to the interaction of visual information processing with emotional activity generated by the deep meaning of photos so that it could produce new concepts in individuals.

4. Conclusion

According to the study that has been presented, it is concluded that applying the photovoice technique in Group Guidance Service can increase the empathy of students. Group guidance is one of the excellent services in guidance and counselling. Group guidance is also essential to support development, especially career development, social development and increasing self-awareness. In its implementation, innovations are needed, whether in the use of methods, techniques or media. Photovoice as a technique has been proven to increase empathy. Then, it can be tested in a broader sample. Including variations of research, both experiments and classroom actions.

Acknowledgement

Praise be to the presence of Allah SWT because, with His grace and guidance, the author was able to complete the writing of the research article entitled: "Development of Group Guidance Media Containing Santri Values to Increase Student Resilience" without significant obstacles. The writing of this progress report was inseparable from the role of many parties, so the author expresses deep gratitude to (1) Prof. Dr. Nur Hasan, M.Kes, and (2) Prof. Dr. Turhan Yani, M.A

Declarations

- Author contribution** : Denok Setiawati prepares the data collection tools, finds the research data, and finishes the scientific articles. Sarah Kurnia Miranda prepares and proofreads the paper. Muhamad Afifuddin Ghozali, visualize the research article and translate the scientific articles.
- Funding statement** : Information about the funding statement isn't available.
- Conflict of interest** : The author declares that there is no conflict of interest regarding the publication of this manuscript.
- Additional information** : No further information is available for this paper.

References

- Aldrup, K., Carstensen, B., & Klusmann, U. (2022). Is empathy the key to effective teaching? A systematic review of its association with teacher-student interactions and student outcomes. *Educational Psychology Review*, 34(3), 1177-1216. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-021-09649-y>
- Ali, M., & Asrori, M. (2014). *Metodologi dan Aplikasi Riset Pendidikan*. PT Bumi Aksara.
- Creighton, G., Oliffe, J. L., Ferlatte, O., Bottorff, J., Broom, A., & Jenkins, E. K. (2018). Photovoice ethics: Critical reflections from men's mental health research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 28(3), 446-455. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732317729137>
- Davis, M. H., Soderlund, T., Cole, J., Gadol, E., Kute, M., Myers, M., & Weihing, J. (2004). Cognitions associated with attempts to empathize: How do we imagine the perspective of another? *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 30(12), 1625-1635. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167204271183>
- Delgado, H., & Wester, K. (2020). Using photovoice to promote meaning-making in a suicide loss support group. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 42(3), 189-205. <https://doi.org/10.17744/mehc.42.3.01>
- Farida. (2015). Bimbingan keluarga dalam membantu anak autisme. *KONSELING RELIGI: Jurnal Bimbingan Konseling Islam*, 6(80), 64-88. [10.21043/kr.v6i1.1040](https://doi.org/10.21043/kr.v6i1.1040)
- Fitri, Z. A., & Haryanti, N. (2020). *Metodologi penelitian pendidikan*. Madani Media.
- Hamdi, A. S., & Bahruddin, E. (2014). *Metode penelitian kuantitatif aplikasi dalam pendidikan*. Deepublish.
- Jiménez-Alonso, B., & Bresco de Luna, I. (2022). Grief, photography and meaning making: A psychological constructivist approach. *Culture & Psychology*, 28(1), 107-132. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1354067X211015416>
- Lamm, C., Rütgen, M., & Wagner, I. C. (2019). Imaging empathy and prosocial emotions. *Neuroscience letters*, 693, 49-53. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neulet.2017.06.054>
- Massengale, K. E., Strack, R. W., Orsini, M. M., & Herget, J. (2016). Photovoice as pedagogy for authentic learning: Empowering undergraduate students to increase community awareness about issues related to the impact of low income on health. *Pedagogy in Health Promotion*, 2(2), 117-126. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2373379916639066>
- Meyers, S., Rowell, K., Wells, M., & Smith, B. C. (2019). Teacher empathy: A model of empathy for teaching for student success. *College Teaching*, 67(3), 160-168. <https://doi.org/10.1080/87567555.2019.1579699>
- Muhidin, S. A., & Abdurahman, M. (2007). *Analisis korelasi, regresi, dan jalur dalam penelitian (Dilengkapi aplikasi program SPSS)*. Pustaka Setia.

- Mysyuk, Y., & Huisman, M. (2020). Photovoice method with older persons: A review. *Ageing & Society, 40*(8), 1759-1787. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X19000242>
- Nechita, F. (2018). Role of empathy in teaching. *Bulletin of the Transilvania University of Braşov. Series IX: Sciences of Human Kinetics, 10*(9), 117-122.
- Pralibroda, B., Krieg, B., Murdock, L., & Havelock, J. (2009). *A practical guide to photovoice: sharing pictures, telling stories and changing communities*. Canada: Winnipeg, Manitoba R3B 3H9
- Primasari, A. K., Ramli, M., & Atmoko, A. (2021). *Bimbingan kelompok virtual teknik photovoice untuk meningkatkan empati siswa sekolah menengah pertama* (Doctoral dissertation, State University of Malang).
- Sanjaya, W. (2013). *Penelitian pendidikan: Jenis, metode, dan prosedur*. Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Saputra, W. N. E., Supriyanto, A., Astuti, B., Ayriza, Y., & Adiputra, S. (2020). The effect of student perception of negative school climate on poor academic performance of students in Indonesia. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research, 19*(2), 279-291. <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.19.2.17>.
- Setianingrum, I., & Da Costa, A. (2023). Mapping research on Indonesian professional teacher: The bibliometric analysis. *Journal of Professional Teacher Education, 1*(2), 60-71. <https://doi.org/10.12928/jprotect.v1i2.638>
- Siombiwi, E. W., Usman, I., & Korompot, S. (2022). Pengaruh bimbingan kelompok terhadap perilaku empati siswa. *Student Journal of Guidance and Counseling, 1*(2), 12–22. <https://doi.org/10.37411/sjgc.v1i2.1256>.
- Supriyanto, A., Saputra, W. N., Handaka, I. B., Barida, M., Widyastuti, D. A., Muyana, S., ... & Sari, M. D. (2022). Student problem assessment (SPA) in the COVID-19 condition in terms of 10 sub areas of life problems (10-ALP). *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction, 12*(1), 199-206. <https://doi.org/10.47750/pegegog.12.01.20>.
- Supriyanto, A., Wibowo, M. E., Mulawarman, M., & Japar, M. (2024). A valid and reliable self-peace scale with indicators of love, care and fearlessness for adolescent drug users. *Retos: nuevas tendencias en educación física, deporte y recreación, 58*(58), 247-255. <https://doi.org/10.47197/retos.v58.102567>.
- Tippin, G. K., & Maranzan, K. A. (2019). Efficacy of a photovoice-based video as an online mental illness anti-stigma intervention and the role of empathy in audience response: A randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology, 49*(6), 381–394. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jasp.12590>.
- Ulviatun, E. (2016). Peningkatan empati melalui teknik photovoice pada kelas X. *E-Journal Bimbingan dan Konseling, 10*(5), 340–346.
- Walther, J., Brewer, M. A., Sochacka, N. W., & Miller, S. E. (2020). Empathy and engineering formation. *Journal of Engineering Education, 100*(2), 20301. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/jee.20301>.
- Wink, M. N., LaRusso, M. D., & Smith, R. L. (2021). Teacher empathy and students with problem behaviors: Examining teachers' perceptions, responses, relationships, and burnout. *Psychology in the Schools, 58*(8), 1575-1596. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pits.22516>
- Zulvianti, N. (2012). Komunikasi empati dalam pelayanan masyarakat. *Al Munir: Jurnal Komunikasi dan Penyiaran Islam, 3*(2), 95-109. <https://doi.org/10.15548/amj-kpi.v0i0.728>